REPORT 1

SUBJECT COMMITTEE SITE VISIT REPORTS

ITEM 7

17 NOVEMBER 2010

Attendance – Verbally updated at Committee

REPORT OF Head of Planning & Building Control

APPLICATION NO. P10/W1240 & P10/W1241/LB **APPLICATION TYPE**FULL & Listed Building Consent

REGISTERED 06.09.2010 **PARISH** GORING

WARD MEMBER(S) Mrs Ann Ducker MBE
Mrs Pearl Slatter

APPLICANT Mr Stuart Hunt

SITE W H Napper & Son High Street Goring-on-Thames PROPOSAL (1) The enlargement of an existing bedsit through

the conversion of an adjoining single storey storage shed, to create a single storey one bed dwelling. (2) The conversion of Napper's Barn to form a two bed dwelling (as an amendment to extant permission P03/E0990). (3) The erection of a pair of single storey car ports. (4) The erection of a detached two

storey dwellinghouse.

AMENDMENTS P10/W1241/LB amplified by additional information

accompanying email from agent dated 22 October

2010.

GRID REFERENCE 459961/180803 **OFFICER** Miss G Napier

1.0 INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 The applications have been referred to the Planning Committee because the recommendation conflicts with the views of the Parish Council.
- 1.2 The application site is shown on the OS extract <u>attached</u> as Appendix 1. The application site comprises the land and buildings to the rear of Napper's Stores, a grocery shop on the High Street in Goring. The range of buildings which are all attached comprise the shop, a house known as Nappers Cottage, a one bed residential unit (referred to throughout as 'the bedsit') and a barn. The barn is currently rented out to a building company for builder's storage purposes. The Stores is a grade II listed building and as such, the attached buildings are all curtilage listed. The buildings lie within the Chilterns Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty and the Goring Conservation Area.

2.0 PROPOSAL

2.1 This planning application seeks full planning permission for the enlargement of the bedsit (for which a certificate of lawful use was granted on 20 August 2009) in to the adjoining single storey storage shed, the conversion of Napper's Barn to form a two

bed dwelling (as an amendment to the extant permission P03/E0990), the erection of two single storey car ports and the erection of a detached two storey dwelling.

The listed building application is purely for the enlargement of the bedsit in to the adjoining storage shed.

2.2 The applications were accompanied by a Design and Access Statement and a Schedule of Works which can be viewed on the Council's website www.southoxon.gov.uk. The plans of the proposed development are attached as Appendix 2.

3.0 **CONSULTATIONS & REPRESENTATIONS**

- 3.1 Goring Parish Council – Refuse. Concerns that the proposed window within the west facing end of the barn would overlook the neighbour. The 'front' elevation of the barn conversion faces directly on to the proposed 3 bed dwelling behind it and the barn conversion and bedsit amenity area are very close resulting in an unneighbourly relationship. The amenity space of the existing 3 bed cottage will have a ground floor bedroom window looking directly on to it and users of Garden Area 1 would look directly in to the neighbouring bedroom. This is undesirable and unneighbourly. The amenity space for the cottage has been reduced to an unacceptable level and the parking provision is inadequate. The proposed new dwelling would have a very limited garden. On bin days there could be considerable disruption caused to pedestrians and people trying to enter the site. There will be considerable intensification of use of the access should the development go ahead and site lines are often obscured by delivery vans and vehicles. The application would be an overdevelopment of the site due to overlooking, density and loss of amenity as well as serious highway safety implications.
- 3.2 **County Archaeological Services** No objections
- 3.3 **Goring and Streatley Amenity Soc** Object. The development would significantly increase the frequency of vehicle movements in and out the narrow driveway endangering vehicles and pedestrians. Reducing the hazardous nature of this location, at the heart of Goring was one of the priority actions identified by villagers in the Goring Village Plan.
- 3.4 **Conservation Officer** No objection to the conversion of Napper's Barn or to the enlargement of the 'bedsit', subject to appropriate conditions. Objection to the new dwelling on the grounds that the further subdivision of the plot would be harmful to the setting of the listed buildings. The remaining green open space to the rear of Napper's makes an important contribution to the setting of the listed buildings and the erection of a new dwelling would detract from their setting and from the character and appearance of the conservation area. 'The design and size of the new dwelling has been modified, but this does not overcome the previous in-principal objection, nor does it resolve issues with making the dwelling reflect its immediate context, alter jumbled and uncharacteristic fenestration and resolve unbalanced elevations so the objections raised previously with regards to design also still stand'.
- 3.5 Countryside Officer No objection. Standard Informative recommended re: bats
- 3.6 **Forestry Officer** No objection. Landscaping scheme and tree protection conditions recommended
- 3.7 **OCC Highway Officer** No objection. 'By comparison to the previously withdrawn application, these proposals involve a reduction in scale of accommodation (for the

two-storey detached dwelling-house, from 4/5 beds to 3 beds) and so represents an improvement, in Highways terms. On balance the likely potential for any increases in the use of the access was not considered to be sufficient to warrant the refusal of planning permission on highway grounds.

- 3.8 **Contaminated Land Officer** No objection. Contaminated land condition recommended.
- 3.9 **Neighbour Object** (3) Concerns over the flow of traffic in to and out of the site and the resulting impact on highway safety given the narrowness of the High Street at this point and hazards for users of mobility scooters
 - The proposed first floor window within the barn conversion would overlook our garden and look directly in to our bedroom. The first floor window within the new detached dwelling would also overlook our property. The development of the barn and the new dwelling will be an overdevelopment of the garden site and would be out of keeping with the local environment. The increase in vehicle movements and the parking and turning of vehicles within the site have not been well thought out.

4.0 **RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY**

4.1 **P10/W0536/LB.** The enlargement of an existing bedsit, through the conversion of an adjoining single storage shed to create a single storey one bed dwelling. Withdrawn prior to determination on 09 July 2010

P10/W0535. 1.The enlargement of an existing bedsit, through the conversion of an adjoining single storage shed to create a single storey one bed dwelling.

2.The conversion of Napper's barn to form a two bedroom dwelling (amendment to P03/E0990) 3.The erection of a detached single storey garage/store.

(As amended by plans accompanying letter received from agent dated 27 May 2010 & as amended by site plan accompanying letter from Agent dated 16 June 2010). Withdrawn prior to determination on 09 July 2010

P09/W0937/LB. Internal and external alterations to create a two bedroom dwellinghouse (variation of Listed Building Consent Ref. P04/E0020/LB). (As amended by Drawings accompanying Agent's email dated 16 November 2009). Also amended by drgno PVD 352/A207-2, A205_4, accompanying email received from the Agent dated 23rd November 2009. Listed Building Consent on 17 December 2009

P09/W0618/LD. Use of building as a self-contained flat. Certificate of Lawful Use or Development on 20 August 2009

P04/E0020/LB. Conversion of existing barn to form an additional dwelling. (As amplified by letter from the agent dated 6 February 2004). Listed Building Consent on 19 February 2004

P03/E0990. Conversion of existing barn to form an additional dwelling. (As amplified by letter from the agent dated 6 February 2004). Planning Permission on 13 February 2004

5.0 **POLICY & GUIDANCE**

5.1 Adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan Policies (SOLP 2011):

C2: Development in an Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty

C9: Landscape features

CON3: Alterations & extensions to listed buildings

CON5: Setting of a listed building

CON7: Proposals affecting a conservation area D1: Good design and local distinctiveness

D2: Vehicle and bicycle parking
D3: Plot coverage and garden areas

D4: Privacy and daylight

D8: Promoting efficient use of energy
 D10: Provision for the management of waste
 D11: Infrastructure and service requirements
 H4: Development in the towns and larger villages

H8: Density of new development

G2: Protection and enhancement of the environment

G5: Making the best use of land G6: Promoting good design

R2: Provision of outdoor playing space

T1: Promoting a sustainable transport network

Planning Policy Statements (PPS's):

PPS1: Delivering sustainable development

PPS3: Housing

PPS5: Planning for the Historic Environment

PPS22: Renewable energy

South Oxfordshire Design Guide 2008; All sections.

Goring Village Plan 2006

6.0 PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

- 6.1 The main considerations in the determination of these applications are:
 - Principle of a new dwelling
 - H4 criteria
 - Whether adequate standards of privacy and amenity have been provided
 - Whether sufficient sustainable measures have been incorporated into the design of the dwellings
 - Impact of the new dwelling on the character and appearance of the conservation area and on the setting of the listed buildings
 - Impact on the architectural and historic qualities of the listed buildings
 - Impact on the Chilterns Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty
 - Trees
 - Bats
- 6.2 **Principle of a new dwelling.** The site lies within the built up limits of the settlement of Goring which is listed under para. 5.17 of the Local Plan as a larger village outside the green belt. The proposal will therefore be considered against the criteria of Policy H4 of the Local Plan which states that proposals for housing on sites of up to 0.5 hectares within the larger villages outside the green belt will be permitted provided that it complies with the five criteria of the policy. The plot for the new dwelling (including the access) measures some 0.05 hectares and as such, the principle of the proposed development is acceptable.

The use of the bedsit as a separate unit of accommodation has already been established under a previous certificate of lawful use (P09/W0618/LD) and as such, there is no 'in principle' objection to the enlargement of this unit in to the adjoining shed.

Similarly, planning permission and listed building consent were granted in 2004 for the conversion of Napper's Barn to a dwelling and the current application seeks to make some revisions to the approved scheme. The 2004 permission has commenced and is therefore still extant so the use of the barn as a dwelling has already been established.

6.3 **H4 criteria issues**

(i) Loss of an important open space.

The site lies within the built-up limits of the village and the site proposed for the new dwelling is currently an open garden. The plot is surrounded on all four sides by development and public views of the site from High Street are very limited due to the fact that the plot tapers to the west at the rear and the dwelling would be sited behind existing buildings at Napper's yard. As such, the proposal would not involve the loss of an important open space.

6.4 (ii) Design, height and scale of the proposed development

Design. The surrounding area is a mixture of various styles and characters of development. Directly to the east of the site is the former Taylor Pen Factory which is a two storey twentieth century building with a shallow mono-pitch roof. To the north (rear) of the site is a 1970's residential development comprising two storey detached and semi-detached dwellings and to the south west is the post office with a residential unit at the rear. Directly to the south is the curtilage listed Napper's Barn which is clad in timber boarding above a brick and flint plinth.

The proposal is for a two storey, 3 bed dwelling on an 'L' shaped footprint and the design has been revised following the withdrawal of the previous application. The main changes that have been made include a reduction in the height of the dwelling by some 900mm, a reduction in the width by some 1300mm, a reduction in the depth by some 400mm and an overall reduction in the footprint of some 20%. In addition, the internal garage has been deleted, as has the front conservatory. The openings have been regularised in terms of their size and to the front elevation, they have been realigned to make the facade more symmetrical.

The size of the dwelling has therefore been reduced to address the concerns that were raised by officers on the previous application and the elevations have been simplified in accordance with South Oxfordshire Design Guide Principles. Whilst dormer windows which cut through the eaves line are not generally encouraged, as this can result in the need for additional down piping, planning permission has been granted in recent years for a number of dwellings within the surrounding area which are of a very similar design to that which is now proposed. These include the terrace on Cleeve Road for which planning permission was granted in 2006 (P06/W0423) and the Belleme Mews development on Station Road for which planning permission was granted in 2005 (P05/W0254). Having regard to these recent consents, officers consider that the design of the dwelling is in keeping with the character of the area.

The design of the new dwelling has been kept simple and the materials proposed are red brick under a plain clay tile roof with timber windows and doors. Officers consider that the proposed materials are in keeping with the local vernacular and the simple, uncluttered elevations with uniformly aligned openings would not detract from the character of the area. The flared arches add interest to the simple elevations and this feature can be found on a number of the surrounding properties.

The design of the Napper's Barn conversion remains largely unchanged from what has already been allowed. The main changes are that the lean-to at the side has been deleted and a new first floor window is now proposed in each gable end. No openings are proposed within the roof slope however and domestic features have been kept to a minimum in accordance with advice contained within the SODG regarding building conversions.

The shed was previously being converted to form part of the barn residence but it is now proposed to use the shed to enlarge the bedsit. There is a slight reduction in, and a rearrangement of, openings to the front elevation of the shed but the design of the development is still considered to be acceptable.

Height and Scale.

Officers considered that the ridge height of the new dwelling should be no higher than the ridge of the listed barn to ensure that it does not dominate or overwhelm the listed building. At 6.9 metres high, the new dwelling is the same height as the barn. The surrounding development is mainly two storey in height and as such, officers consider that the scale of the development would not be inappropriate.

No increase in the height of the barn or the adjoining shed is proposed as part of the development.

Housing Density. The site as a whole measures some 0.115 hectares and the housing density as a result of the proposed development would be approximately 34.8 dwellings per hectare. Until June 2010, PPS3 sought to secure a minimum density of 30 dwellings/hectare and although this minimum requirement has now been scrapped to allow local authorities and communities to decide for themselves the best locations and types of development in their areas, a density of 34.8 dwellings in this village centre location would not be inappropriate in your officer's view. The density of The Birches, a housing development to the north west is some 36.8 dwellings per hectare whilst the density of Maple Court is some 31.4

6.5 (iii) the character of the area is not adversely affected. The new dwelling would be set back from the High Street by almost 60 metres and it would be located behind The Stores and Napper's Barn. The dwelling would be no higher than the adjacent barn and the design of the property is considered to be in keeping with the established character of the area whilst the proposed construction materials reflect the local vernacular. The proposed conversion works are sympathetic to the established character of the barns and domestic intrusions have been kept to a minimum.

The existing and new planting would help to soften the development and as already discussed, the scale of the proposed development is considered by officers to be acceptable and appropriate given the established character of the area.

6.6 **iv) there are no overriding amenity, environmental or highway objections.**Policy H4 of the SOLP seeks to resist development that would be harmful to the amenities of occupants of nearby properties with particular reference to privacy, outlook, sunlight, daylight, noise and disturbance.

The new dwelling would be erected at a distance of some 25.5 metres from the north facing elevation of Napper's Barn. The first floor windows within the front elevation of the new dwelling would look on to the garden area belonging to Napper's Barn but the distance between the properties exceeds the Council's minimum back-to-back window distance of 25 metres as set out under para. 3.2.6 of the SODG and the proposed car

ports would afford the Napper's Barn garden some privacy. Officers are therefore satisfied that the relationship with the barn would be acceptable.

To the rear of the site, the car park which serves the commercial offices at Thames Court separates the plot from the properties at Maple Court. The back-to-back distance between the new dwelling and the houses at Maple Court is some 28 metres which again, is in excess of the Council's minimum standard.

No first floor windows are proposed within the west elevation of the dwelling which faces on to Laburnam Cottage. The front elevation of the new dwelling would be erected at a distance of some 26 metres from the rear elevation of Laburnam Cottage.

A new first floor window is proposed within the west facing gable of the barn conversion. This would face on to the gable of Laburnam Cottage and the occupant of the neighbour property considers that the new bedroom window would look in to their bedroom window and in to their garden. Having visited the neighbouring property officers consider that the window would look out on to the side elevation of Laburnam Cottage and as the neighbours bedroom window is within the rear elevation of the building, it would not be possible for users of the bedroom at the barn to see around the corner and in to the neighbours property.

Whist some views of the rear garden at Laburnam Cottage would be possible, it is currently overlooked by the first floor window at The Old Coach House and there is an access way along the side of the Post Office which leads to a parking area and commercial bin store. There are no boundary treatments around the garden and as such anybody using the parking area or bin store is afforded full and unobstructed views of the garden at Laburnum Cottage. Your officers therefore consider that the proposal to install a window within the side elevation of the barn would not have a material impact on the level of privacy that is currently enjoyed by the occupants of Laburnum Cottage.

6.7 **Highway safety and parking standards.** Road safety in the High Street is one of the concerns that are addressed in the Goring Village Plan 2006. The Highway Officer has visited the site and discussed the proposed development with Goring Parish Council.

The use of the bedsit as a separate residential unit has already been established and the incorporation of a living area and kitchen into this (through the conversion of the adjoining shed) in Highways terms, still results in a one-bedroom structure. The parking standard for a unit of this size is one space which is to be provided within the existing courtyard area to the South of Napper's Barn. As such by comparison to what is already permitted the proposals do not involve an intensification of the use of the access.

With regard to the conversion of Napper's Barn to form a two bed dwelling (as an amendment to P03/E0990), an extant permission exists for this development and the scale of the proposals, by comparison to the extant permission is comparable and the 1 or 2 parking spaces allocated to the Barn are considered concordant with the adopted parking standards.

The proposed 3 bed dwelling does represent an intensification of the use of the site in Highways terms. On balance, however, this development facilitates the improvement of the manoeuvring space by the incorporation of a turning head for the site and this improvement overrides any potential disbenefit of the likely traffic from the house. The existing gates are to be removed and officers consider that should Members resolve

to grant planning permission, a condition should be attached requiring the gates to be removed prior to the occupation of the barn and the new dwelling to ensure that vehicles do not have to wait on the highway whilst the gates are opened. Planning permission would be required for the installation of any new gates or other means of enclosure because of the listed building status and so the Council can ensure that the site (and manoeuvring area) remains open in perpetuity.

Finally it was also taken into account that the location is relatively sustainable; opportunities exist for commuting by train whilst nearby parking is available for visitors (as well as some potential for this within the site) on a free basis for short stays and at a low cost for longer stays. On balance the likely potential for any increases in the use of the access will not be material and do not warrant the refusal of planning permission on highway safety grounds.

Your officers therefore consider that the proposal would not be detrimental to the safety and convenience of other users of the highway.

6.8 v) if the proposal constitutes backland development, it would not create problems of privacy and access and would not extend the built limits of the settlement. The proposed dwellings would constitute backland development and as discussed above, your officers consider that the proposal would not create problems of privacy.

The site is surrounded on all sides by development and is within the built limits of the village. The proposal would not therefore extend the built limits of the settlement, in accordance with the aims of the Goring Village Plan.

It is therefore concluded that the proposed development does comply with all five criteria and is contrary to Policy H4 of the Local Plan.

6.9 Whether adequate standards of privacy and amenity have been provided. Policy D4 of the adopted SOLP states that 'new dwellings should be designed to ensure adequate privacy for existing and new residents to enable them to enjoy their homes without undue intrusion from neighbours or from the public.

The garden area for the new three bed dwelling measures some 100 metres square and there is a further small amenity area at the rear of the property and as such, the size of the garden complies with the Council's standards. Whilst the garden area will be overlooked from the adjacent offices, it is not unusual to be overlooked within a town /village centre location such as this. The offices are unlikely to be used in the evenings and at weekends and so the garden will be afforded some privacy during these times. Furthermore, the future purchaser of the property would be aware of the relationship with neighbouring properties from the outset.

There are no first floor windows within the front elevation of the barn conversion and so garden 2 which serves the enlarged bedsit will not be directly over looked at close proximity. Gardens 1 & 2 are below the Councils' required standards but at present, Napper's Cottage and the bedsit share an amenity area. Whilst the location of amenity area 1 outside the one bed unit is undesirable, this is an existing situation following the grant of a certificate of lawful use for the property as a separate residential unit.

On balance your officers consider that the proposed development is acceptable.

6.10 Whether sufficient sustainable measures have been incorporated into the design

of the dwellings. The District Council encourages the use of renewable energy technologies, especially where new build is proposed. The Design & Access Statement accompanying the application states that the new dwelling, barn conversion and extended bedsit would be constructed/converted to accord with Code Level 3 of the Code for Sustainable Homes (as is now required by Part L1A 2010 of the Building Regulations).

Your officers are therefore satisfied that the proposed development would accord with Policy D8 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.

6.11 Impact of the new dwelling on the character and appearance of the conservation area and on the setting of the listed buildings. The site lies within the Goring Conservation Area and the conservation officer considers that the green space to the rear of the barn makes an overall positive contribution to its character. Public views of the green space are not readily available from outside the site because it is set back from the High Street by over 30 metres and is obscured from view by the outbuildings at the rear of The Stores.

Whilst the area of green space would be diminished by the development and the setting of the listed buildings would be somewhat affected by the further subdivision of the plot, your officers consider that the negative impacts are limited and that a refusal of planning permission on these grounds would not be justified.

- 6.12 Impact on the architectural and historic qualities of the listed buildings. The conservation officer has no objection to the enlargement of the existing bedsit. This section of barn has already been assessed for conversion under proposals in 2004 and your officers do not consider the current proposals any more harmful. The additional information which was provided by the agent on 22 October 2010 has made clearer the situation regarding the implications of insulation and is considered to be acceptable. The creation of first floor accommodation within the barn has also already been agreed under listed building application P09/W0937/LB.
- 6.13 **Impact on the Chilterns Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty.** The scale and design of the proposed development is considered to be acceptable and the materials that are to be used in the new development and conversions are considered to be sympathetic to the character of the area.
- 6.14 **Trees.** The trees on the site are not the subject of a tree preservation order, however the site is within the conservation area affording the trees protection. Two fruit trees are shown on the application plans as being retained. The Fruit tree growing within the front garden of the proposed dwelling is a B category tree and must be retained and protected throughout the development, (this could be a condition). The large fruit tree within the garden of the barn is also to be retained and as such, will need to be protected throughout the development.
- 6.15 **Bats.** There is no objection to the proposal as information submitted shows the barn is unlikely to be a bat habitat.

7.0 **CONCLUSION**

7.1 The development lies within the well defined confines of the built up part of Goring and there is no objection to the principle of housing development. Whilst the development would affect the setting of the listed buildings and the character of the conservation area it would result in the provision of two family sized dwellings and one small residential unit in a sustainable location at the centre of the village. The design of the new dwelling is considered to be acceptable and all three properties would comply with Code Level 3 of the Code for Sustainable Homes. The development facilitates the improvement of the manoeuvring space by the incorporation of a turning head for the site and the scheme is otherwise generally in accordance with Development Plan Policies.

8.0 **RECOMMENDATION**

- 8.1 Grant planning permission subject to the following conditions:
 - 1. Commencement 3 yrs Full Planning Permission
 - 2. Approved plans
 - 3. Sample materials (all)
 - 4. Unique: Removal of gates
 - 5. Contaminated land investigation
 - 6. Landscaping scheme (Trees & shrubs)
 - 7. Tree Protection (General)
 - 8. Parking & Manoeuvring areas retained
 - 9. Unique Cycle parking
 - 10. Windows & external doors to specification
 - 11. No additional windows or other openings
- 8.2 Grant listed building consent subject to the following conditions:
 - 1. Commencement 3 yrs Listed Building Consent
 - 2. Approved plans
 - 3. Works to match existing
 - 4. Submission of detailed drawings
 - 5. Submission of sample materials
 - 6. Cast iron rainwater goods

Author Miss G Napier **Contact No.** 01491 823737

Email Add. gabriella.napier@southoxon.gov.uk